

Procedural Review Voting Sheet 2012 Cycle 7

REGION: **Japan**
 COMMITTEE: **Information & Control Committee**
 EVENT: **SEMICON Japan 2012**
 DATE OF MEETING: **2012/12/7**
 PLACE OF MEETING: **International Conference Hall, Makuhari Messe**
 COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: **Takayuki Nishimura/Dainippon Screen, Mitsuhiro Matsuda/Hitachi Kokusai**
 SEMI STAFF: **Hirofumi Kanno**

A&R Voter: Name/Company
 Date: 200X/MM/DD

I. Document Number & Title

#5423	Line-item Revision to SEMI E40.1-0312 SECS-II SUPPORT FOR PROCESSING MANAGEMENT STANDARD and SEMI E5-0712 SEMI EQUIPMENT COMMUNICATIONS STANDARD 2 MESSAGE CONTENT (SECS-II); Add mapping to PPID for RecID
--------------	--

II-1 Line item 1

Line Item 1	Line item #1 – Add mapping to PPID for RecID
--------------------	---

1. Tally (Staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after the close of the voting period

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return		Distribution		Return Rate	
Yellow	53	÷	88	=	60.2%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	3					

Total Vote	56					
Reject	3					
Accept	29					

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

2. Rejects

Note, please directly refer to the Negative 2 of Reject 2 below.

Reject 1 (thierry de Villeneuve / STmicroelectronics)

Negative 1 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary		
	Reason	*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included. 1.1 A/ <PPID> format is 10 or 20. <RCPSPEC> is 20 only. Existing Host softwares SECS-GEM drivers are configured to handle S16,F3 messages with an item of type 20 at the position of <RCPSPEC>. Failures will occur if a <PPID> of type 10 is passed down to the driver instead.		
	Withdrawal	<input type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made GO TO "Related" section	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX GO TO "Final" → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason	
		Motion by/2nd by		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason	
		Motion by/2nd by		
		Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3		

		2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO “Final” → (C)
		90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option”
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of “if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action” or “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
	Motion	The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
Final	Negative is:		
	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)	
	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R	Not approved		
	Reason:		

Negative 2 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included.	
		<p>1.2 B/ There is no way for the SECS-GEM driver to determine it has to process a S16,Fxx with a <PPID> instead of a <RCPSPEC>.</p> <p>Because of A/ and B/ this ballot will introduce non-backward compatibility issues. A direct replacement of <RCPSPEC> with <PPID> is not possible this way.</p> <p>As far as I have understood the proposed solution from reading the ballot, the need seems legitimate but the solution would require perhaps additional analysis efforts.</p>	
Withdrawal	No withdrawal made	GO TO “Related” section	

		Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion			
Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"	
	[Negative is not related] < 2/3		
	2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
	90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		Reason	
	Motion by/2nd by		
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3			
2/3=< [Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%		GO TO "Final" → (C)	
90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]		GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
	Motion	The negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)	

		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
Final	Negative is:		
	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)	
	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R		Not approved	
	Reason:		

Disposition of Reject 1

2	Original number of Negatives	(g)
0	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
0	# of Negatives found not related	(i)
2	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)
Final	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
	$g-(h+i+j)>0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
	Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R		Not approved
	Reason:	

Reject 2 (Thomas Hoogenboom / ASML)

Negative 1 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included. 1.3 a) If S16,F3 and S16,F11 are changed, S16,F15 should also be changed in the same way	
Withdrawal		No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
		Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)
	Motion and	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	

Related	Reason	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)		
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
		Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX			
		[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"	
		[Negative is not related] < 2/3		
		2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
		90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
		Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
		Reason		
	Motion by/2nd by			
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)		[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
			[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
			2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)
			90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
	Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)	
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (B) OR (C)	
Motion		The negative is "not significant".		
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Vote			XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)	
Final	Negative is:			
	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)		

	<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	related and persuasive DOCUMENT FAILS
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See comment #x	
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved	
		Reason:	

Negative 2 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	<p>*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included.</p> <p>1.4 b) Allowing a PPID can change the response to a S14,F1 GetAttr request for a process job object.</p> <p>Specifically, instead of a format 20 attribute value, the recipe name attribute can now return a format 10 attribute value (since PPID can be either format 20 or 10). Software programmed to retrieve the RCPSPEC value in this manner may not be prepared to handle a binary PPID value.</p>	
Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
	Reason		
Motion by/2nd by			
Discussion			
Result of Vote (check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
Reason		Because RecID in the process job object allows only Text format. But the ballot allows setting the attribute with binary value.	

	Motion by/2nd by	Tadashi Mochizuki (TELST) / Yoshihisa Takasaki (DAINIPPON SCREEN MFG.)		
	Discussion	None		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	12-0		
		X	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
			[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
			2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)
		90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Not Significant Finding Option	<p style="color: orange;">This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)</p>			
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
	Motion		The negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)	
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)	
Final	Negative is:			
		(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)	
		(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
		(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	X	(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x			
A&R		Not approved		
	Reason:			

Disposition of Reject 2

	Original number of Negatives	(g)
	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)
	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)

Final	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
	$g-(h+i+j)>0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
	Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

Reject 3 (James Webster / PEER Group)

Negative 1 of Reject 3

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary		
	Reason	*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included. 1.5 The change to the SECS message definition to include an OR condition in the valid data items does not seem to be valid given that there are no other messages that follow that pattern.		
Withdrawal		No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section	
		Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.		
		*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)		
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
		Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Result of Vote (check ONE)	Discussion			
	XX-XX			
		[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"	
		[Negative is not related] < 2/3		
		2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
	90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"		
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
		Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
		Reason	XXXX	
Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			

	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX	
		[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO “Final” → (E)
		[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
		2/3= \leq [Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO “Final” → (C)
		90% = \leq [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option”
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of “if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action” or “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
	Motion	The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
Final	Negative is:		
	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)	
	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R		Not approved	
	Reason:		

Disposition of Reject 3

	Original number of Negatives	(g)
	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)
	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)
Final	g-(h+i+j)=0	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
	g-(h+i+j)>0	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>

		Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> Not Valid
--	--	---------------------------	------------------------------------

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R		Not approved
		Reason:

3. Comments

Comment 1

Comment	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	From	Franz Putz (znt Zentren für Neue Technologien GmbH)	
	Comment	I don't like the inexact item definition "<RCPSPEC> or <PPID>" in SEMI E5 SECS messages. I also do not have a better idea to bring the PPID into SEMI E40. But maybe some description would be useful, when to use PPID or when to use RCPSPEC.	
	Discussion		
Action proposed		The committee agreed to do one of the following actions.	
		*No motion is required in this step.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the committee.
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the task force for more consideration.
		<input type="checkbox"/>	New Business
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Other
	Editorial Change		
		Case 1: No vote in this section :	
		To be included and voted on in <u>4. Summary of Editorial Changes</u>.	
		Case 2: Voted in this section :	
		Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.	
	1	FROM: Section xxx	
	To: Section xxx		
	Justification (If necessary)		
2	FROM: Section xxx		

		To: Section xxx
		Justification (If necessary)
Motion by/2nd	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote	XX-XX Motion passed (or failed)	
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	

4. Summary of Editorial Changes

5. Approval Conditions Check

6. Preliminary action for this line item

Motion	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review as balloted.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review with editorial changes	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and work will be discontinued.	
Motion by/ 2nd by	Yoshihisa Takasaki (DAINIPPON SCREEN MFG.) / Tadashi Mochizuki (TELST)		
Discussion	None		
Vote	12-0		
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed	
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved	
	Reason:		

III. Safety Check

This section applies to the entire document.

See Section 14 of the Regulations for further information

Motion:	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is not a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Safety Checklist is complete and has been included with the document throughout the balloting process. (Regulations ¶ 14.3)	
Motion by/ 2nd by	Name (Company) / Name (Company)		
Discussion	XXXX		
Vote	XX-XX Motion passed or failed		
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved	
	Reason:		

IV. Intellectual Property Check

Note: This ballot may be all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information

		The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline.	
		No potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known	GO TO SECTION V
		Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee.	GO TO SECTION V
		Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but an LOA or copyright release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee	
MOTION	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ask ISC for special permission to publish	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Quit activity	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.	
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion		XXXX	
Vote		XX-XX	
Final Action		<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion Passed
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion Failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved	
		Reason:	

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.

V. Action for this document

Motion (Check all applicable items)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) 1 failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed committee review and work will be discontinued.	
Motion by/ 2nd by		Yoshihisa Takasaki (DAINIPPON SCREEN MFG.) / Tadashi Mochizuki (TEL ST)	
Discussion		None	
Vote		12-0	
Final Action		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved	

	Not approved
	Reason: