Procedural Review Voting Sheet

2013 Cycle 1

REGION: China
COMMITTEE: PV
EVENT: SOLARCON China 2013
DATE OF MEETING: 2013/3/18
PLACE OF MEETING: Kerry Hotel, Shanghai, China
COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: Guangchun Zhang/Canadiansolar, Jun Liu/CESI
SEMI STAFF: Kris Shen

A&R Voter: Name/Company
Date: 200X/MM/DD

I. Document Number & Title

Document 5428	Document Title New Standard: Specification for Impurities in Polyethylene Packaging Materials for Polysilicon Feedstock

II. Tally (Staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return		Distribution		Return Rate	
Yellow	87	÷	144	=	60.4%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	52					

Total Vote	139					
Reject	1					
Accept	31					

A&R		Not approved
		Reason:

III. Rejects

Reject 1 (Jean Marie Collard/Solvay)

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary		
	Reason	§ 6.5 calls for quantitative specifications (impurity limits) but no validated analytical methods are supplied, so this cannot be called a standard but a guide. Also, "Surface contamination" and "Body contamination" are not described. I guess we should read "Bulk" and not "Body" in this case. Finally, the some of metallic impurities in polyethylene is unrealistic, it's always above 1 ppm. Ant by the way the list of metallic impurities does not reflect the nature of the PE. Some very common impurities in PE material are not mentioned		
Withdrawal		x	No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related"
			Withdrawal document received by staff on	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason		"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
			*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
			Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
			Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
			Reason	XXXX
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
			[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
			[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
			2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)
sua siv	Motion and Reason		Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
			Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	

			Reason	Partly accept the advice: 1.It is a standard ,not a guide, and the analytical will be presented in several months. 2.Accepted. 3.This is a specification for poly-silicon,so the elements which will affect the quality of polysilicon are emphasized in this standard.In consideration of the metallic impurities sometimes cannot meet the specification,we modify the paragraph to: 1.1.1 The total content of 15 elements impurities shall be accord with the Table 3. Table 3 The Tolerance of Impurities Contamination for Different Grades

	Grade 1 Ppbw	Grade 2 ppbw	Grade 3 ppbw
Surface impurities contamination	20	40	80
Bulk impurities contamination	1000	2000	4000
Attention	The total content of impurities contamination includes 15 elements ((B、Na、Mg、Al、P、K、Ca、Cr、Mn、Fe、Ni、Cu、Zn、As、Pb)		

Motion by/2nd by	Liu Xiaoxia (GCL poly)/		
Discussion	The task force leader will attempt to contact the voter and report committee's position.		
Result of Vote (check ONE)	19-0		
	X	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3 [Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	**GO TO "Final" → (E)**
		2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	**GO TO "Final" → (C)**
		90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	**GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"**

Not Significant Finding Option	**This option can only be used "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)**		
	x	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	**GO TO → (D)**

			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (C)
	Motion		The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
			XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (C)
Final		Negative is:		
			(A) withdrawn (counted under **h** in disposition)	
			(B) not related (counted under **i** in disposition)	
			(C) related and not persuasive (significant)	
			(D) not significant (counted under **j** in disposition)	
		x	(E) related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
			Comment generated. See comment #x	
A&R		Not approved		
		Reason:		

IV. Comments

Comment	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	From	VargasBernal, Rafael, (AFF_ITSdl)	
	Comment	Change the symbol used as "," because appears another symbol in Subsections 6.5.1 and 6.6.1. In 6.6.1 must be separated three words.	
	Discussion	Accepted.	
Action proposed		**The committee agreed to do one of the following actions.**	
		*No motion is required in this step.	
		No further action was taken by the committee.	
		Refer to the task force for more consideration.	
		New Business	
		Other	
	Editorial Change		
		Case 1: No vote in this section :	
		To be included and voted on in § 5. Summary of Editorial Changes.	
		Case 2: Voted in this section :	
		Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.	
	1	**FROM: Section xxx**	

			To: Section xxx
			Justification (If necessary)
		2	**FROM: Section xxx**
			To: Section xxx
			Justification (If necessary)
Motion by/2nd			Name (Company)/Name (Company)
Vote			XX-XX Motion passed (or failed)
A&R			**Not approved**
			Reason:

V. Summary of Editorial Changes

Note: Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.

1

FROM: Section 6.5

Surface Impurities Contamination

The total content of 15 elements impurities (B、Na、Mg、Al、P、K、Ca、Cr、Mn、Fe、Ni、Cu、Zn、As、Pb) on the surface of PE material ≤20ppbw

Body Impurities Contamination

The total content of 15 elements impurities (B、Na、Mg、Al、P、K、Ca、Cr、Mn、Fe、Ni、Cu、Zn、As、Pb) in the body of PE material≤1000ppbw

TO: Section 6.5

The total content of 15 elements impurities shall be accord with the **Table 3**.

Table 3 The Tolerance of Impurities Contamination for Different Grades

	Grade 1 Ppbw	Grade 2 ppbw	Grade 3 ppbw
Surface impurities contamination	20	40	80
Bulk impurities contamination	1000	2000	4000
Attention	The total content of impurities contamination includes 15 elements ((B、Na、Mg、Al、P、K、Ca、Cr、Mn、Fe、Ni、Cu、Zn、As、Pb)		

	Justification: (If necessary)
2	**FROM: Section XXX**
	TO: Section XXX
	Justification: (If necessary)

Motion	To approve the above editorial changes
Motion by/2nd by	Liu Xiaoxia (GCL Poly)/Lu Wenfeng (GCL Poly)
Discussion	None
Vote	XX-XX Motion passed (or failed)
A&R	**Not approved**
	Reason:

VI. Approval Conditions Check

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, or not persuasive. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of the valid accept and reject votes must be accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.3)

Note: if both approval conditions are not satisfied, the document fails.

			Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)				
	Approval Rate	=	31	/		=	#DIV/0!		>=90%

A&R	**Not approved**
	Reason:

VII. Safety Check

See § 14 of the Regulations for further information

Motion:	x	This is not a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete.
		This is a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete.
		Safety Checklist (Regulations ¶ 14.3) is complete and has been included with the document throughout the balloting process.
Motion by/2nd by		Liu Xiaoxia (GCL Poly)/Lu Wenfeng (GCL Poly)
Discussion		None
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed or failed
A&R		**Not approved**
		Reason:

VIII. Intellectual Property Check

Note: This ballot may be all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information

	The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline.		
	x	No potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known	**GO TO SECTION IX**
		Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee.	**GO TO SECTION IX**
		Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but an LOA or copyright release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee	
	MOTION	Ask ISC for special permission to publish	
		Quit activity	
		Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion	XXXX	
	Vote	XX-XX	
	Final Action	Motion Passed	
		Motion Failed	
A&R		**Not approved**	

	Reason:

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.

IX. Action for this document

Motion		This document passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	x	This document passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
		This document failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
		This document failed committee review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/2nd by		Liu Xiaoxia (GCL Poly)/Lu Wenfeng (GCL Poly)
Discussion		None
Vote		XX-XX
Final Action		Motion passed
		Motion failed
A&R		**Approved**
		Not approved
		Reason: