

Procedural Review Voting Sheet 2013 Cycle 2

REGION: **Korea**

COMMITTEE: Information & Control

EVENT: **off venue event**

DATE OF MEETING: April 19, 2013

PLACE OF MEETING: SEMI Korea Office, Seoul

COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: Chulhong Ahn/SK hynix, Kevin Lee/Miracom, Hyungsu Kim/
Samsung SDS

SEMI STAFF: Natalie Shim

A&R Voter: Name/Company

Date: 200X/MM/DD

I. Document Number & Title

Document 5386A	Document Title Line Item Revision to SEMI E94-0312, Specification for Control Job Management, Enhancement of Material Redirection Mode
---------------------------	---

II. Tally (Staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return		Distribution	=	Return Rate	
Yellow	54	÷	86	=	62.8%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	29					
Total Vote	83					
Reject	3					
Accept	27					

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

III. Rejects

Reject 1 (Mitsugu Sato/ Canon)

Negative 1 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	*Original negative comment and justification should be included. At scenario #3, there is no CarrierinputSpec.	
Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon. *This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
		Reason	XXXX
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)
<input type="checkbox"/>			
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
	Reason	I think that it doesn't need to describe all attributes in the example scenario. If you see the existing E94-related information 1, you can easily find other examples which omit some attributes. Therefore, I think it can be omitted in here, too.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Yun Kyung Cho(Samsung Electronics)/ Byoung Min Im(TEL Korea)	
	Discussion	Sakamoto(TEL) said it should be corrected even though it is approved.	
Result of Vote (check ONE)	8-0		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)

			[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
			2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO “Final” → (C)
		X	90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option”
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)			
		X	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (C)
	Motion		The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (C)	
Final	Negative is:			
		(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		(B)	not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
		X (D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
		Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R		Not approved		
		Reason:		

Disposition of Reject 1

	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
Final	X	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		$g-(h+i+j)>0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

Reject 2 (Tadashi Mochizuki/ TEL)

Negative 1 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	*Original negative comment and justification should be included. About added text on 11.3.1, the definition that the carrier completes when nothing is going in or out does not specify any difference from the case of Integrity mode because the condition will indicate true not only for the Redirection mode but also for the Integrity mode.	
Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
		Reason	XXXX
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)
sua siv	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)

		Reason	<p>“in the case of using Material Redirection Mode (Destination Map is not empty)” was described in the document as a different condition. It includes the Integration mode as a default when it is empty.</p> <p>In Slot Integrity mode, even if there are no substrates waiting to move in or out to the carrier, it is not able to enter “completed” before the control job complete.</p> <p>I think it is the difference.</p>
	Motion by/2nd by	Jin Soo Jung(Kodi-s)/ You Jin Park(Choong-Ahang University)	
	Discussion	None	
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	8-0	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO “Final” → (E)
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
		<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO “Final” → (C)
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option”	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (C)
	Motion	The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (C)
Final	Negative is:		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A) withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(B) not related (counted under i in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(C) related and not persuasive (significant)	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(D) not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(E) related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R	Not approved		

	Reason:
--	---------

Negative 2 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary		
	Reason	*Original negative comment and justification should be included. Table 6, #3, Control Job Create; no Carrier Input Spec. is specified.		
Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon. *This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section) Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass) Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason XXXX	
		Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
		Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related] < 2/3		
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
<input type="checkbox"/>				
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason	Thank you for your comment. I think that it doesn't need to describe all attributes in the example scenario. If you see the existing E94-related information 1, you can easily find other examples which omit some attributes. Therefore, I think it can be omitted in there		
	Motion by/2nd by	Jae Hoon Lee(Choong-Ahang University)/ Sang Hee Eom(PSK)		
	Discussion	None		
Result of Vote (check ONE)	8-0			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3		

		2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO “Final” → (C)
	X	90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option”
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)		
	X	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (C)
	Motion	The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (C)
Final	Negative is:		
		(A) withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		(B) not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		(C) related and not persuasive (significant)	
	X	(D) not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		(E) related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R		Not approved	
		Reason:	

Disposition of Reject 2

	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
Final	X	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		$g-(h+i+j)>0$	Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		Reject without a Negative	Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R	Not approved
----------------	---------------------

	Reason:
--	---------

Reject 3 (Takashi Nakagawa/ Yokogawa)

Negative 1 of Reject 3

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary		
	Reason	*Original negative comment and justification should be included. In Table R1-6 #8, the timing of substrate in process should not be same as carrier in access. Carrier should be access when substrate become at-source-to-at-work.		
	Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> "Related" is mutually agreed upon.		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> *This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)		
		<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
		<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
		Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is not related] < 2/3		
		<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
sua siv	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		

		Reason	<p>It is intended to show the time based scenario for Carrier Accessing Status. To be more exact, there are no definitions of relationship between E90 and E87. But, we already knew that we should consider the relationship. (at-source to at-work is also not same as Carrier In Access)</p> <p>For explaining the Carrier Accessing Status, You indicated the "Substrate Transport" state, But, I choose the "Substrate Processing" state. I think Substrate Transport's meaning is close to physical state of substrate, and Substrate Processing's is close to logical state. Carrier Accessing Status is also logical state.</p> <p>And, Substrate Transport state can't explain the substrates abnormally completed, But, Substrate Processing state can do.</p> <p>Therefore, I think Substrate Processing (Needs processing to In Processing) is more practical example.</p>
	Motion by/2nd by	Jin Soo Jung(Kodi-s)/ Yoo Ho Choi(SK hynix)	
	Discussion	None	
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	6-0	
		[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
		[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
		2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)
		X 90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	<p>This option can only be used "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)</p>		
	X	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (C)
	Motion	The negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (C)
Final	Negative is:		
	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	

A&R	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
		Reason:

VII. Safety Check

See § 14 of the Regulations for further information

Motion:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This is not a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Safety Checklist (Regulations ¶ 14.3) is complete and has been included with the document throughout the balloting process.
	Motion by/2nd by Byoung Min Im(TEL Korea)/ Yun Kyung Cho(Samsung Electronics)	
Discussion		None
Vote		6-0 Motion passed
A&R	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
		Reason:

VIII. Intellectual Property Check

Note: This ballot may be all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline.	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known	GO TO SECTION IX
<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee.	GO TO SECTION IX
<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but an LOA or copyright release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee	
MOTION	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ask ISC for special permission to publish
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Quit activity
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.
Motion by/2nd by		
Discussion		
Vote		XX-XX
Final Action		<input type="checkbox"/> Motion Passed
		<input type="checkbox"/> Motion Failed
A&R	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Not approved

	Reason:
--	----------------

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.

IX. Action for this document

Motion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and work will be discontinued.	
Motion by/2nd by		Byoung Min Im(TEL Korea)/ Yun Kyung Cho(Samsung Electronics)	
Discussion		Sakamoto(TEL) said if someone has implemented the capability based on scenario he /She might have a bug. I would like to request to any GEM300 TFs to correct the scenarios in the Related Information.	
Vote		6-0	
Final Action		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved	
		Reason:	