

Procedural Review Voting Sheet 2013 Cycle 2

REGION: **NA**
 COMMITTEE: Facilities and Gases
 EVENT: **NA Spring**
 DATE OF MEETING: April 2, 2013
 PLACE OF MEETING: SEMI HQ, San Jose, CA
 COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: Steve Lewis (CH2M Hill)
 SEMI STAFF: Kevin Nguyen

A&R Voter: Name/Company
 Date: 200X/MM/DD

I. Document Number & Title

5505	Revision to SEMI C58-0305 (Reapproved 0211), Specifications and Guidelines for Hydrogen
-------------	---

II. Tally (Staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: **As-cast tally after close of voting period**

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return		Distribution		Return Rate	
Yellow	28	÷	45	=	62.2%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	16					
Total Vote	44					
Reject	3					
Accept	14					

A&R		Not approved
		Reason:

III. Rejects

Reject 1 (Supika Mashiro/TEL)

Negative 1 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	"Specification" is a subtype of Standard that is defined in the Regulations, but "Guideline" is not authorized type of SEMI Standards Document or subtype of Standards under the Regulations since 2005. In a Reapproval ballot this may be justifiable but for a revision, current Regulation must be followed.	
	Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
		<input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> "Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> *This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason		
	Motion by/2nd by		
Discussion	None		
Result of Vote (check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"	
	<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is not related] < 2/3		
	<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>		
Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
	<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
	Reason		
Motion by/2nd by	Mohamed Saleem (Fujikin)/Chris Sanders (MTECH)		
Discussion	None		
Result of Vote (check ONE)	6-0		
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)	
	<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3		
<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)		

		90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (C)
	Motion	The negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (C)
Final	Negative is:		
		(A) withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		(B) not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		(C) related and not persuasive (significant)	
		(D) not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	x	(E) related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R	Not approved	Reason:	

Disposition of Reject 1

	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
Final	x	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		$g-(h+i+j)>0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
		Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R	Not approved	Reason:
-----	--------------	---------

Other Negatives and comments include:

Mashiro, Supika (TEL)

Rejects

Negative 1 Document title

“Specification” is a subtype of Standard that is defined in the Regulations, but “Guideline” is not authorized type of SEMI Standards Document or subtype of Standards under the Regulations since 2005. In a Reapproval ballot this may be justifiable but for a revision, current Regulation must be followed.

Negative 2 General

Even if the title of the document is renamed to Specification and Guide, this document is not clear about which part is written as specification and which part is written as Guide. I don't recommend combining Specification and Guide in one Document in the first place, but if such format is the choice of the committee, at least there should be clear identification which section belongs to which Standard subtype.

Requirements and Recommendations are intertwined in the document and it is difficult for the reader to identify which parts constitute the specification.

Even if the document is written as a “Specification” it could include option. Just having some recommendations doesn't necessitate the document should be written as Guide.

Lobert, Jurgen (Entegris)

Rejects

This document is supposed to contain requirements for hydrogen. There is not a single requirement listed. Also: requirements for what? The use, the purity, the filtration....?

Collard, Jean Marie (Solvay)

Rejects

Table 1 : it says 'Carbon Dioxide (CO₂) + Carbon Dioxide (CO₂)' ! I suppose we should read 'Carbon Dioxide (CO₂) + Carbon Monoxide (CO)'

Benore, Justin (MGC Pure Chemicals America)

Abstain with comment

Section 7.1 Table 1 of impurities: It appears from redlines as though carbon dioxide will be changed to 'Carbon Dioxide (CO₂) + Carbon Dioxide (CO₂)'. This appears to be redundant.

IX. Action for this document

Motion		This document passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
		This document passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	x	This document failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
		This document failed committee review and work will be discontinued.

Motion by/2nd by	Mohamed Saleem (Fujikin)/Mathew Milburn (UCT)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	6-0	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	