

Procedural Review Voting Sheet 2013 Cycle 2

REGION: **NA**
 COMMITTEE: Facilities and Gases
 EVENT: **NA Spring**
 DATE OF MEETING: April 2, 2013
 PLACE OF MEETING: SEMI HQ, San Jose, CA
 COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: Steve Lewis (CH2M Hill)
 SEMI STAFF: Kevin Nguyen

A&R Voter: Name/Company
 Date: 200X/MM/DD

I. Document Number & Title

5520	Reapproval of SEMI F69-0708, Test Methods for Transport and Shock Testing of Gas Delivery Systems
-------------	---

II. Tally (Staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: **As-cast tally after close of voting period**

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Accepts	/	(Accepts + Valid	=	#DIV/0!	≥ 90%
Approval Rate	<input style="width: 50px; height: 20px;" type="text"/>	/	<input style="width: 50px; height: 20px;" type="text"/>	=	<input style="width: 50px; height: 20px;" type="text"/>	≥ 90%

A&R		Not approved
		Reason:

III. Rejects

Reject 1 (Jurgen Lobert/Entegris)

Negative 1 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	This is not really a method. A method needs to describe individual steps on HOW to carry out a test. You may reword it to 'Guidelines for...' instead of 'Test method for', else add information on how to do the test. There needs to be a top-level chapter 'Method' between 'scope' and 'Limitations'.	
	Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
		<input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/> "Related" is mutually agreed upon.	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)
		<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Reason	
	Motion by/2nd by		
	Discussion	None	
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is not related] < 2/3	
		<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Reason	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion	XX-XX	
		Result of Vote (check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3
<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3			
<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%			GO TO "Final" → (C)
<input type="checkbox"/> 90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]			GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"

Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (C)
	Motion	The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority		GO TO → (C)	
Final	Negative is:		
	<input type="checkbox"/> (A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> (B)	not related (counted under i in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/> (C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	<input type="checkbox"/> (D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/> (E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/> Not approved		
	Reason:		

Disposition of Reject 1

	Original number of Negatives	(g)
	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)
	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)
Final	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> $g-(h+i+j)=0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	<input type="checkbox"/> $g-(h+i+j)>0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R	<input type="checkbox"/> Not approved	
	Reason:	

IV. Comments

Comment 1

Comment	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	From	Mathew Milburn (UCT)	
	Comment	MIL STD 810 was updated from F to G in 2008. Sections 514.5 and 516.5 do not exist in MIL STD 810G. Either F69 needs to be updated to reference the new shock and vibration sections of the 810G spec or note that F69 is referencing 810F only.	
	Discussion	<p>Comment is correct. Adding STD810 would be a technical change.</p> <p>Motion: To accept this comment related and persuasive By / 2nd: Mohamed Saleem (Fujikin)/ Mathew Milburn(UCT) Discussion: Document will need rebalot Vote: 6-0. Motion passed</p>	
Action proposed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The committee agreed to do one of the following actions.	
		*No motion is required in this step.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the committee.	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the task force for more consideration.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	New Business	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Other	
	Editorial Change		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Case 1: No vote in this section :	
		To be included and voted on in <u>§ 5. Summary of Editorial Changes.</u>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Case 2: Voted in this section :	
	Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in "FROM" and "TO" fields.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	FROM: Section xxx		
1	To: Section xxx		
	Justification (If necessary)		
2	FROM: Section xxx		

		To: Section xxx
		Justification (If necessary)
Motion by/2nd	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote	XX-XX Motion passed (or failed)	
A&R		Not approved
	Reason:	

V. Summary of Editorial Changes

No editorial change was proposed.

VI. Approval Conditions Check

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, or not persuasive. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of the valid accept and reject votes must be accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.3)

Note: if both approval conditions are not satisfied, the document fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid)			
Approval Rate	=	<input type="text"/>	/	<input type="text"/>	=	<input type="text" value="#DIV/0!"/>	>=90%

A&R		Not approved
	Reason:	

VII. Safety Check

See § 14 of the Regulations for further information

Motion:	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is not a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Safety Checklist (Regulations ¶ 14.3) is complete and has been included with the document throughout the balloting process.
Motion by/2nd by		
Discussion		None
Vote		Motion
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	

VIII. Intellectual Property Check

Note: This ballot may be all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information

The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	No potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known	GO TO SECTION IX
<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee.	GO TO SECTION IX
<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but an LOA or copyright release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee	
MOTION	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ask ISC for special permission to publish
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Quit activity
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.
Motion by/2 nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)
Discussion		XXXX
Vote		XX-XX
Final Action		<input type="checkbox"/> Motion Passed
		<input type="checkbox"/> Motion Failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.

IX. Action for this document

Motion	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/2nd by	Mohamed Saleem (Fujikin)/Mathew Milburn (UCT)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	6-0	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	