

# Procedural Review Voting Sheet 2013 Cycle 2

REGION: **Japan**  
 COMMITTEE: **Information and Control Committee**  
 EVENT: **Japan Spring 2013 Meetings**  
 DATE OF MEETING: **2013/4/10**  
 PLACE OF MEETING: **SEMI Japan, Tokyo**  
 COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: **Takayuki Nishimura/Dainippon Screen MFG., Mitsuhiro Matsuda/Hitachi Kokusai Electric**  
 SEMI STAFF: **Chie Yanagisawa**

A&R Voter: Name/Company  
 Date: 200X/MM/DD

## I. Document Number & Title

<b>Document 5423A</b>	<b>Line-item Revision to SEMI E40.1-0312 SECS-II SUPPORT FOR PROCESSING MANAGEMENT STANDARD and SEMI E5-0712 SEMI EQUIPMENT COMMUNICATION STANDARD 2 MESSAGE CONTENT (SECS-II); Add mapping to PPID for RecID</b>
---------------------------	---

## II-1 Line item 1

<b>Line Item 1</b>	<b>Add mapping to PPID for RecID</b>
--------------------	--------------------------------------

### 1. Tally (**Staff to fill in**)

**Voting Tally: As-cast tally after the close of the voting period**

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return		Distribution		Return Rate	
Yellow	54	÷	86	=	62.8%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	29	-----				
Total Vote	83					
Reject	2					
Accept	33					

<b>A&amp;R</b>		<b>Not approved</b>
		<b>Reason:</b>

## 2. Rejects

### Reject 1 (Jan Rothe / GLOBALFOUNDRIES Dresden Module Two LLC & Co. KG)

#### Negative 1 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	<p>*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included.</p> <p>1) The idea behind the ballot is valid, but it may be confusing to the implementer to show two different data types for the same part of a message. I am not aware of any similar practice and I feel this proposal is technically not sound due to the potential type ambiguity introduced. A technically sound and more straightforward way of addressing the underlying issue would be to reference the definition of PPID from the definition RCPSPEC in E5.</p>	
Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.
		<input type="checkbox"/>	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
		Reason	XXXX
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion			
Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)
<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
		Reason	As the voter noted, the intent of this ballot is technically valid. PPID should not be set into RCPSPEC at the message definition standard document (SEMI E5) as RCPSPEC is not always referred from SEMI E40.1 but potentially from the other SEMI Standards. Therefore, it should be defined in SEMI E40.1.
	Motion by/2nd by	Tadashi Mochizuki (TEL) / Yoshihisa Takasaki (Dainippon Screen MFG.)	
	Discussion	None.	
Result of Vote	12-0		

	(check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → <b>(E)</b>
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → <b>(C)</b>
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)			
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"		GO TO → <b>(D)</b>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"		GO TO → <b>(B) OR (C)</b>
	<b>Motion</b>	The negative is "not significant".		
	<b>Motion by/2nd by</b>	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	<b>Vote</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → <b>(D)</b>
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → <b>(B) OR (C)</b>	
<b>Final</b>	Negative is:			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>(A)</b>	withdrawn (counted under <b>h</b> in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>(B)</b>	not related (significant) (counted under <b>i</b> in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>(C)</b>	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>(D)</b>	not significant (counted under <b>j</b> in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>(E)</b>	related and persuasive	<b>DOCUMENT FAILS</b>
	Comment generated. See comment #x			
<b>A&amp;R</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>Not approved</b>		
		<b>Reason:</b>		

### Disposition of Reject 1

1	Original number of Negatives	<b>(g)</b>	
0	# of Negatives withdrawn	<b>(h)</b>	
0	# of Negatives found not related	<b>(i)</b>	
1	# of Negatives found not significant	<b>(j)</b>	
<b>Final</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>g-(h+i+j)=0</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject <b>is Not Valid and is not</b> included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>g-(h+i+j)&gt;0</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject <b>is</b> included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> <b>Not Valid</b>

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

<b>A&amp;R</b>	<b>Not approved</b>
	<b>Reason:</b>

## Reject 2 (Alison McKenzie / PEER Group, Inc.)

### Negative 1 of Reject 2

<b>Negative</b>	<b>Referenced Section</b>	<b>*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary</b>		
	<b>Reason</b>	<b>*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included.</b>		
		The change to the SECS message definition to include an OR condition in the valid data items presents difficulties for Host and Equipment software to validate which data item is expected.		
<b>Withdrawal</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made	<b>GO TO "Related" section</b>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	<b>GO TO "Final" → (A)</b>	
<b>Related</b>	<b>Motion and Reason</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)</b>	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related <b>(needs over 1/3 votes to pass)</b>	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related <b>(needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)</b>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason	XXXX	
	<b>Motion by/2nd by</b>	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
<b>Discussion</b>				
<b>Result of Vote (check ONE)</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX-XX		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	<b>GO TO "Persuasive"</b>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	<b>GO TO "Final" → (B)</b>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is not related]	<b>GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"</b>	
<b>Persuasive</b>	<b>Motion and Reason</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive <b>(needs over 1/3 votes to pass)</b>	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive <b>(needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)</b>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason	There is no validation issue as those data items (RCPSPEC, PPID) are not referred dynamically but defined statically between equipment and host prior to implementation.	
	<b>Motion by/2nd by</b>	Tadashi Mochizuki (TEL) / Yoshihisa Takasaki (Dainippon Screen MFG.)		
	<b>Discussion</b>	None.		
<b>Result of Vote (check ONE)</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	12-0		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	<b>GO TO "Final" → (E)</b>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3		

			2/3= $\leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive] $\leq$ 90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)	
		X	90% = $\leq$ [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)				
		X	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)	
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (B) OR (C)	
	Motion		The negative is "not significant".		
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)	
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)		
Final	Negative is:				
		(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)		
		(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)		
		(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)		
	X	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)		
		(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS	
	Comment generated. See comment #x				
A&R		Not approved			
	Reason:				

### Disposition of Reject 2

1	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
0	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
0	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
1	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
Final	X	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is <b>Not Valid</b> and is <b>not</b> included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
		$g-(h+i+j)>0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
		Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> <b>Not Valid</b>

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R		Not approved
	Reason:	

### 3. Comments

None.

### 4. Summary of Editorial Changes

None.

### 5. Approval Conditions Check

**APPROVAL CONDITION 1:** All negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, or not persuasive. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2)

**APPROVAL CONDITION 2:** At least 90% of the sum of the valid accept and reject votes must be accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.3)

**Note:** if both approval conditions are not satisfied, the balloted item fails.

	Accepts		(Accepts + Valid)		=		>=90%
Approval Rate	=	33	/	33	=	100.0%	

### 6. Preliminary action for this line item

<b>Motion</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review as balloted.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review with editorial changes
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and work will be discontinued.
<b>Motion by/ 2nd by</b>	Tadashi Mochizuki (TEL) / Yoshihisa Takasaki (Dainippon Screen MFG.)	
<b>Discussion</b>	None.	
<b>Vote</b>	12-0	
<b>Final Action</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
<b>A&amp;R</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	

## II-2 Line item 2

<b>Line Item 2</b>	<b>Editorial Change of E5-0712</b>
--------------------	------------------------------------

### 1. Tally (Staff to fill in)

**Voting Tally:** As-cast tally after the close of the voting period

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return		Distribution		Return Rate	
Yellow	54	÷	86	=	62.8%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	29	-----				
Total Vote	83					
Reject	0					
Accept	30					

A&R		Not approved
		Reason:

### 2. Rejects

None.

### 3 Comments

None.

### 4. Summary of Editorial Changes

None.

### 5. Approval Conditions Check

**APPROVAL CONDITION 1:** All negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, or not persuasive. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2)

**APPROVAL CONDITION 2:** At least 90% of the sum of the valid accept and reject votes must be accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.3)

**Note:** if both approval conditions are not satisfied, the balloted item fails.

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid			
Approval Rate	=	<input style="width: 50px; text-align: center;" type="text" value="30"/>	/	<input style="width: 50px; text-align: center;" type="text" value="30"/>	=	<input style="width: 50px; text-align: center;" type="text" value="100.0%"/>	>=90%

## 6. Preliminary action for this line item

Motion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review as balloted.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review with editorial changes
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by		Tadashi Mochizuki (TEL) / Yoshihisa Takasaki (Dainippon Screen MFG.)
Discussion		None.
Vote		12-0
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	

## III. Safety Check

This section applies to the entire document.

See Section 14 of the Regulations for further information

Motion:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This is not a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Safety Checklist is complete and has been included with the document throughout the balloting process. (Regulations ¶ 14.3)
Motion by/ 2nd by		Tadashi Mochizuki (TEL) / Yoshihisa Takasaki (Dainippon Screen MFG.)
Discussion		None.
Vote		12-0 Motion passed.
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	

## IV. Intellectual Property Check

Note: This ballot may be all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known	GO TO SECTION V
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee.	GO TO SECTION V
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but an LOA or copyright release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee	

	<b>MOTION</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ask ISC for special permission to publish
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Quit activity
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.
	<b>Motion by/2<sup>nd</sup> by</b>	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	<b>Discussion</b>	XXXX	
	<b>Vote</b>	XX-XX	
	<b>Final Action</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion Passed
<input type="checkbox"/>		Motion Failed	
<b>A&amp;R</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>Not approved</b>	
		<b>Reason:</b>	

\* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.

## V. Action for this document

<b>Motion (Check all applicable items)</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) 1 and 2 passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed committee review and work will be discontinued.	
<b>Motion by/ 2<sup>nd</sup> by</b>	Tadashi Mochizuki (TEL) / Yoshihisa Takasaki (Dainippon Screen MFG.)		
<b>Discussion</b>	None.		
<b>Vote</b>	12-0		
<b>Final Action</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed	
<b>A&amp;R</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>Approved</b>	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>Not approved</b>	
		<b>Reason:</b>	