

# Procedural Review Voting Sheet 2011 Cycle 5

REGION: **NA**  
 COMMITTEE: PV Materials  
 EVENT: **NA Fall Standards Meetings**  
 DATE OF MEETING: October 26, 2011  
 PLACE OF MEETING: SEMI HQ, San Jose, CA  
 COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: Dick Hockett/Evans Analytical Group  
 SEMI STAFF: Kevin Nguyen

A&R Voter: Name/Company  
 Date: 200X/MM/DD

## I. Document Number & Title

<b>5157A</b>	New Standard: Specifications for Sulfuric Acid, Used In Photovoltaic Applications
--------------	---

## II. Tally (Staff to fill in)

**Voting Tally: As-cast tally after close of voting period**

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return		Distribution		Return Rate	
Yellow	35	÷	57	=	61.4%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	28					
Total Vote	63					
Reject	1					
Accept	13					

<b>A&amp;R</b>	<b>Not approved</b>
<b>Reason:</b>	

### III. Rejects

#### Reject 1 (Supika Mashiro /Tokyo Electron)

##### Negative 1 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	2.1 The scope of this document is for grades of sulfuric acid used in the photovoltaic industry.		
	Reason	<p>Negative The sentence is incomplete and makes no sense as the scope. Scope should be clear about which specifications are covered in the Standard. If the standard addresses different grades, coverage of grades and corresponding specifications are also the scope of the Standard.</p>		
	Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO "Final" → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.		
		*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)		
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
		Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Negative is not related] < 2/3		
		<input type="checkbox"/> 2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/> Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
		Reason	<p>This is the standard scope format for all PV chemicals as well as semiconductor chemical guides and specifications currently published. Examples of other standards (e.g PV16 (Nitric Acid), PV20 (Hydrochloric Acid)), etc . . . were shown to the PV Committee during review. None of them call out grades in the Scope. Additionally, the member offering the reject agreed by e-mail that she would not object if the task force found her rejection non-persuasive.</p>	
	Motion by/2nd by	Marty Burkhart (Hi Pure Tech)/ Win Baylies (BayTech Group)		
	Discussion	None		
	Result of Vote	12-0		

	(check ONE)	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)			
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"		GO TO → (D)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"		GO TO → (C)
	Motion	The negative is "not significant".		
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (C)	
Final	Negative is:			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	not related (counted under i in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x			
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved		
	Reason:			

### Disposition of Reject 1

1	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
1	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
Final	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is <b>Not Valid</b> and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	<input type="checkbox"/>	$g-(h+i+j)>0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> <b>Not Valid</b>

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

## IV. Comments

There was no comment submitted

## V. Summary of Editorial Changes

No editorial change was proposed.

## VI. Approval Conditions Check

**APPROVAL CONDITION 1:** All negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, or not persuasive. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2)

**APPROVAL CONDITION 2:** At least 90% of the sum of the valid accept and reject votes must be accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.3)

**Note: if both approval conditions are not satisfied, the document fails.**

Approval Rate	=	Accepts	/	(Accepts + Valid)	=		>=90%
		13		13		100.0%	

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

## VII. Safety Check

See § 14 of the Regulations for further information

Motion:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This is not a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Safety Checklist (Regulations ¶ 14.3) is complete and has been included with the document throughout the balloting process.
Motion by/2nd by		Marty Burkhart (Hi Pure Tech)/ Jean-Marie Collard (Solvay)
Discussion		None

Vote		9-0 Motion passed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	

## VIII. Intellectual Property Check

**Note: This ballot may be all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information**

x	The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline.			
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known	GO TO SECTION IX	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee.	GO TO SECTION IX	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but an LOA or copyright release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee		
	MOTION	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ask ISC for special permission to publish	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Quit activity	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.	
	Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion	XXXX		
	Vote	XX-XX		
	Final Action	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion Passed	
<input type="checkbox"/>		Motion Failed		
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved		
	Reason:			

\* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.

## IX. Action for this document

Motion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/2 <sup>nd</sup> by	Marty Burkhart (Hi Pure Tech)/ Ron Sinton (Sinton Instruments)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	7-0	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed

		Motion failed
A&R		Approved
		Not approved
		Reason: