

Procedural Review Voting Sheet 2012 Cycle 6

REGION: **Japan**
 COMMITTEE: **Silicon Wafer**
 EVENT: **SEMICON Japan 2012**
 DATE OF MEETING: **Dec. 6, 2012**
 PLACE OF MEETING: **Makuhari Messe, Chiba, Japan**
 COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: **Naoyuki J. Kawai/The University of Tokyo, Tetsuya Nakai/SUMCO**
 SEMI STAFF: **Hirfofumi Kanno**

A&R Voter: **Name/Company**
 Date: **200X/MM/DD**

I. Document Number & Title

Document 5441	Document Title Line Items Revision of SEMI M1-0812, Specifications for Polished Single Crystal Silicon Wafers
----------------------	--

II-1 Line item 1

Line Item 1	Line Item Title This line item includes all changes in Section 2.6 of Table 1 (including addition of two new footnotes), in ¶¶ 6.6 through 6.6.3.4 including rearrangement of Tables 3 through 11, and in ¶ R4-7.5 as well as removal of Appendix 3 and addition of Related Information 2.
--------------------	---

1. Tally (**Staff to fill in**)

Voting Tally: As-cast tally after the close of the voting period

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return		Distribution		Return Rate	
Yellow	55	÷	91	=	60.4%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	5					
Total Vote	60					
Reject	2					
Accept	16					

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

2. Rejects

Reject 1 (Peter Wagner / Peter Wagner Consulting)

Negative 1 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	<p>*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included.</p> <p>I reject the addition of Related Information 2. The edge profile parameters, the construction of an edge profile and its measurement are described in detail in the main body of the standard and in M73, therefore edge profile envelopes are unnecessary and superfluous in M1. It will result in confusion, because people will consider them as templates, even as the text tells them not to do this.</p> <p>No other wafer geometry parameter is discussed in such detail in M1 and for no other parameter envelopes are provided. E.g. there are no envelopes for the notch specification, the wafer diameter or the laser mark windows. So why should there be a lengthy section about envelopes of edge profile?</p> <p>M1 is a wafer specification and not a textbook for educating or training of the users of the standard. If the Si Wafer Committee sees some value in related Information 2, then this could maybe be published as an Auxiliary Information document. If at all, this would be a much better place for the content of RI2.</p>	
Withdrawal		No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
	X	Withdrawal document received by staff on Oct 22, 2012 Memo; The Task Force rechecks withdrawn and considers new business.	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason	XXXX	
Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
Discussion			
Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"

			[Negative is not related] < 2/3		
			2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
			90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason		Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
			Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
		Reason	XXXX		
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Discussion				
	Result of Vote (check ONE)		XX-XX		
			[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3		GO TO "Final" → (E)
			[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3		
			2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%		GO TO "Final" → (C)
			90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]		GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)				
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)	
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (B) OR (C)	
	Motion		The negative is "not significant".		
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)			
	Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority		GO TO → (D)
			XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority		GO TO → (B) OR (C)
Final		Negative is:			
	X	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)		
		(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)		
		(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)		
		(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)		
		(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS	
		Comment generated. See comment #x			
A&R		Not approved			
	Reason:				

Disposition of Reject 1

1	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
1	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
Final	X	g-(h+i+j)=0	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
		g-(h+i+j)>0	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
		Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

Reject 2 (John Valley / MEMC)

Negative 1 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included. 1. Table 1, in the row after 2-6.6 (editorial correction is required to label this row sequentially) introduces new “optional” specification dimensions that should not be part of the M1 specification document. They are not used in the industry and have been added arbitrarily. Inserting optional specification parameters into M1 is not supported by MEMC. Proposed best solution: a. The lines of optional parameters to be specified, Note #4, and the discussion in ¶ 6.6.3.2.2 and sub- paragraphs should be removed as they are superfluous to the industry standard usage of profile-parameter-based edge profile specification of Table 11.	
Withdrawal		No withdrawal made	GO TO “Related” section
	X	Withdrawal document received by staff on Nov. 29, 2012 Memo: The Task Force considers new business.	GO TO “Final” → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason		“Related” is mutually agreed upon.
			*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)
			Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)
			Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)
	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	

	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX	
		[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO “Persuasive”
		[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
		2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO “Final” → (B)
		90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option”
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX	
		[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO “Final” → (E)
		[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
		2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO “Final” → (C)
		90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO “Not Significant Finding Option”
Not Significant Finding Option	<p>This option can only be used in either case of “if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action” or “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)</p>		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
	Motion	The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
Final	Negative is:		
	X	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)
		(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)
		(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		(E)	related and persuasive
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R		Not approved	

	Reason:
--	---------

Negative 2 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary		
	Reason	<p>*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included.</p> <p>2. Section 6.6.3.2.2 states that "Often" the optional front and back apex lengths are also specified. This is not a verifiable statement of fact and prejudices new adopters of the parameter-based profile approach toward this optional specification format, which is in MEMC view not used or useful in the specification of wafers.</p>		
	Withdrawal	<input type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on Nov. 29, 2012 Memo: The Task Force considers new business.	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"	
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related] < 2/3		
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"		
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason	XXXX
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
		Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)	
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3		
<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)		

		90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
	Motion	The negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
Final	Negative is:		
	X (A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)	
	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R		Not approved	
	Reason:		

Negative 3 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included. 3. Table 8 footnote #5 is confusing. The other Tables (3-7) that reference Cy in Table 10 do not use a footnote. This footnote should be removed.	
Withdrawal		No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
	X	Withdrawal document received by staff on Nov. 29, 2012 Memo: The Task Force considers new business.	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason	XXXX	

	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
<input type="checkbox"/>		[Negative is not related] < 2/3		
<input type="checkbox"/>		2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)	
<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"		
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)		
		Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)		
		Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)			
	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (B) OR (C)	
	Motion	The negative is "not significant".		
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
<input type="checkbox"/>		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)	
Final	Negative is:			
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Comment generated. See comment #x		

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

Negative 4 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included. 4. Table 10 should replace the entry "T/3" with "Cy = T/3" to make the usage of Cy in Tables 3 through 8 more easily understood. The meaning of Cy is otherwise never clearly defined.	
Withdrawal		No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
	X	Withdrawal document received by staff on Nov. 29, 2012 Memo: The Task Force considers new business.	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		Reason	XXXX
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)
<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
			Reason
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
	<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)	

		90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
	Motion	The negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
Final	Negative is:		
	X (A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)	
	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R	Not approved	Reason:	

Negative 5 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	Reason	*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included. 5. Table 10 should replace the entry "T/4" with "Cy = T/4" to make the usage of Cy in Tables 3 through 8 more easily understood.	
Withdrawal		No withdrawal made	GO TO "Related" section
	X	Withdrawal document received by staff on Nov. 29, 2012 Memo: The Task Force considers new business.	GO TO "Final" → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	

	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX	
		[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
		[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
		2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (B)
		90% =< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Discussion		
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX	
		[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
		[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
		2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)
		90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of "if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action" or "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
	Motion	The negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
Final	Negative is:		
	X	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)
		(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)
		(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		(E)	related and persuasive
	Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R		Not approved	

	Reason:
--	---------

Negative 6 of Reject 2

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary		
	Reason	*Original negative comment and as well as justification should be included. 6. Table 11 is inconsistent with Table 1, the second part after 2-6.6. Table 1 should omit the optional parameters.		
	Withdrawal	<input type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made GO TO "Related" section	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on Nov. 29, 2012 Memo: The Task Force considers new business. GO TO "Final" → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3 GO TO "Persuasive"	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related] <90% GO TO "Final" → (B)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is not related] GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
			Reason	XXXX
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
		Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX	
			<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3 GO TO "Final" → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>			[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
<input type="checkbox"/>			2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90% GO TO "Final" → (C)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive] GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"		

Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used in either case of “if the committee finds a negative not related by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action” or “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.1.4, 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (B) OR (C)
	Motion	The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority		GO TO → (B) OR (C)	
Final	Negative is:		
	X	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)
		(B)	not related (significant) (counted under i in disposition)
		(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)
		(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)
		(E)	related and persuasive DOCUMENT FAILS
Comment generated. See comment #x			
A&R		Not approved	
		Reason:	

Disposition of Reject 2

6	Original number of Negatives	(g)	
6	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)	
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)	
	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)	
Final	X	g-(h+i+j)=0	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
		g-(h+i+j)>0	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of <u>V. Approval Conditions Check</u>
		Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R		Not approved	
		Reason:	

3. Comments

Comment 1

Comment	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary	
	From	John Valley (MEMC)	
	Comment	It is bad enough that the distance associated with the bevel is “a” while the distance associated with the apex is called “b” but why must we add optional points of confusion to the M1 parameter-based edge profile specification? On top of that we discuss these optionally specified Table 1 items using a figure that isn’t in the main body of the document. And that figure does not indicate the meaning of apex angle. Again, MEMC does not feel that the optional parameters should be included in Table 1 or discussed in Section 6.6.3.2.2. As is well covered in R2, the permitted thickness variation in the sum of the front and back apex lengths is wide enough that the specification of this sum is superfluous. Edge profile metrology is a technique where “measured thickness” is only weakly connected to the actual thickness as measured using a proper thickness gauge. These four optional parameters (front and back apex length and front and back apex angle) are not currently used in the commercial exchange of wafers. To add them into Table 1 of M1 begs for undue attention, over-specification, confusion, and wasted effort, if not wasted silicon wafers.	
	Discussion	Include it as new business	
Action proposed	X	The committee agreed to do one of the following actions.	
		*No motion is required in this step.	
		No further action was taken by the committee.	
		Refer to the task force for more consideration.	
	X	New Business	
		Other	
	Editorial Change		
			Case 1: No vote in this section :
			To be included and voted on in <u>4. Summary of Editorial Changes.</u>
			Case 2: Voted in this section :
		Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.	
1		FROM: Section xxx	
		To: Section xxx	
		Justification (If necessary)	

2	FROM: Section xxx	
	To: Section xxx	
	Justification (If necessary)	
Motion by/2nd	Friedrich Passek (Siltronic) / Mike Goldstein (Intel)	
Vote	9-0 Motion passed	
A&R	Not approved	
	Reason:	

4. Summary of Editorial Changes

5. Approval Conditions Check

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, or not persuasive. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of the valid accept and reject votes must be accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.3)

		Accepts		(Accepts + Valid)			
Approval Rate	=	16	/	16	=	100.0%	>=90%

Note: if both approval conditions are not satisfied, the balloted item fails.

6. Preliminary action for this line item

Motion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review as balloted.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review with editorial changes
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Friedrich Passek (Siltronic) / Takao Takenaka (Takenaka Consultant)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	9-0	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	Approved	
	Not approved	
	Reason:	

II-2 Line item 2

Line Item 2	Line Item Title This line item includes only removal of § 7
--------------------	--

1. Initial Tally

	Return		Distributio		Return Rate	
Yellow	55	÷	91	=	60.4%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	5					

Total Vote	60					
Reject	0					
Accept	19					

2. Rejects

3 Comments

4. Summary of Editorial Changes

5. Approval Conditions Check

			Accepts		(Accepts + Valid			
Approval Rate	=	<input type="text" value="19"/>	/	<input type="text" value="19"/>	=	<input type="text" value="100.0%"/>		>=90%

6. Preliminary action for this line item

Motion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review as balloted.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review with editorial changes
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by		Friedrich Passek (Siltronic) / Takao Takenaka (Takenaka Consultant)
Discussion		None
Vote		9-0
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	

II-3 Line item 3

Line Item 3	Line Item Title This line item includes all other changes in the document. (See ¶¶ 2.1, 3.1, R3-3.1, R4-7.6 (Note 1), R4-7.7 (including removal of Note 6), and Footnote 3; §§ A1-1, A2-1, A2-2, A3-1, R3-1, and R4-1.)
--------------------	--

1. Initial Tally

Approval Rate	=	Accepts	/	(Accepts + Valid)	=	100.0%	>=90%
		19		19		100.0%	

2. Rejects

3 Comments

4. Summary of Editorial Changes

5. Approval Conditions Check

Approval Rate	=	Accepts	/	(Accepts + Valid Rejects)	=	100.0%	>=90%
		19		19		100.0%	

6. Preliminary action for this line item

Motion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review as balloted.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item passed committee review with editorial changes
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This line item failed committee review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Friedrich Passek (Siltronic) / Takao Takenaka (Takenaka Consultant)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	9-0	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved

	Reason:
--	----------------

III. Safety Check

This section applies to the entire document.
See Section 14 of the Regulations for further information

Motion:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This is not a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This is a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Safety Checklist is complete and has been included with the document throughout the balloting process. (Regulations ¶ 14.3)
Motion by/ 2nd by		Friedrich Passek (Siltronic) / Takao Takenaka (Takenaka Consultant)
Discussion		None
Vote		9-0 Motion passed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
	Reason:	

IV. Intellectual Property Check

Note: This ballot may be all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline.	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known	GO TO SECTION V
<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee.	GO TO SECTION V
<input type="checkbox"/>	Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but an LOA or copyright release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee	
MOTION	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ask ISC for special permission to publish
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Quit activity
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)
Discussion		XXXX
Vote		XX-XX
Final Action		<input type="checkbox"/> Motion Passed
		<input type="checkbox"/> Motion Failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved

	Reason:
--	----------------

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.

V. Action for this document

Motion (Check all applicable items)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) LI1, LI2 and LI3 passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Line item(s) [X], [X] and [X] failed committee review and work will be discontinued.
Motion by/ 2nd by	Friedrich Passek (Siltronic) / Takao Takenaka (Takenaka Consultant)	
Discussion	None	
Vote	9-0	
Final Action	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved
		Reason: