

Procedural Review Voting Sheet 2012 Cycle 7

REGION: **Japan**
 COMMITTEE: **Silicon Wafer**
 EVENT: **SEMICON Japan 2012**
 DATE OF MEETING: **Dec. 6th, 2012**
 PLACE OF MEETING: **Makuhari Messe, Chiba, Japan**
 COMMITTEE CO-CHAIRS: **Naoyuki J. Kawai/The University of Tokyo, Tetsuya Nakai/SUMCO**
 SEMI STAFF: **Hirofumi Kanno**

A&R Voter: Name/Company
 Date: 200X/MM/DD

I. Document Number & Title

Document 5450	Document Title Revision to SEMI M49-0912, Guide for Specifying Geometry Measurement Systems for Silicon Wafers for the 130 nm to 22 nm Technology Generations with Title Change to: Guide for Specifying Geometry Measurement Systems for Silicon Wafers for the 130 nm to 16 nm Technology Generations
--------------------------	--

II. Tally (Staff to fill in)

Voting Tally: **As-cast tally after close of voting period**

A minimum of 60% of the voting interests that have voting members within the technical committee must return votes. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.1)

	Return		Distribution		Return Rate	
Yellow	59	÷	94	=	62.8%	>=60%
Lilac & Others	3					

Total Vote	62					
Reject	1					
Accept	21					

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

III. Rejects

Reject 1 (Masanori Yoshise)

Negative 1 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary		
		In table A1-2, Item 1.10 ZDD		
	Reason	*Original negative comment and justification should be included.		
		In table A1-2, Item 1.10 ZDD, There is no information of reported points for both 32nm and 22nm. These were deleted from original M49-0912.		
	Withdrawal	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	No withdrawal made GO TO "Related" section	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX GO TO "Final" → (A)	
Related	Motion and Reason	<input type="checkbox"/>	"Related" is mutually agreed upon.	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)	XX-XX		
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related] > 1/3 GO TO "Persuasive"	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	2/3=< [Negative is not related] GO TO "Final" → (B)	
Persuasive	Motion and Reason	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
			Reason	
	Motion by/2nd by	Friedrich Passek (Siltronic) / Masanori Yoshise		
	Discussion			
		Result of Vote (check ONE)	7-0	
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3 GO TO "Final" → (E)
<input type="checkbox"/>			[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
<input type="checkbox"/>			2/3=<[Negative is related and not persuasive] <90% GO TO "Final" → (C)	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive] GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"		

Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used “if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action”. (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)		
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “not significant”	GO TO → (D)
		It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative “significant”	GO TO → (C)
	Motion	The negative is “not significant”.	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
	Vote	XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority		GO TO → (C)	
Final	Negative is:		
	(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
	(B)	not related (counted under i in disposition)	
	(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
	(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
	X (E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
		Comment generated. See comment #x	
A&R	Not approved	Reason:	

Negative 2 of Reject 1

Negative	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary item 1.9 ESFQR of 16nm at same table of A1-2	
	Reason	*Original negative comment and justification should be included.	
		Also item 1.9 ESFQR of 16nm at same table of A1-2. Missing Edge Exclusion data. This is to be EE=1mm	
Withdrawal		No withdrawal made	GO TO “Related” section
		Withdrawal document received by staff on XXXX	GO TO “Final” → (A)
Related	Motion and Reason	“Related” is mutually agreed upon.	
		*This motion can be appended to the motion for Persuasive (See Persuasive Section)	
		Negative is related (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
		Negative is not related (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
	Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion			
Result of Vote	XX-XX		

	(check ONE)		[Negative is related] > 1/3	GO TO "Persuasive"
			[Negative is not related] < 2/3	
			2/3=< [Negative is not related]	GO TO "Final" → (B)
Persuasive	Motion and Reason		Negative is related and persuasive (needs over 1/3 votes to pass)	
			Negative is related and not persuasive (needs 2/3 or more votes to pass)	
		Reason	XXXX	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Discussion			
	Result of Vote (check ONE)		XX-XX	
			[Negative is related and persuasive] > 1/3	GO TO "Final" → (E)
			[Negative is related and not persuasive] < 2/3	
			2/3=< [Negative is related and not persuasive] < 90%	GO TO "Final" → (C)
			90% =< [Negative is related and not persuasive]	GO TO "Not Significant Finding Option"
Not Significant Finding Option	This option can only be used "if the committee finds a negative not persuasive by a vote equal to or greater than 90% of the persons voting on the action". (Regulations ¶ 9.5.3.3.2)			
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "not significant"	GO TO → (D)
			It is mutually agreed upon to term the negative "significant"	GO TO → (C)
	Motion		The negative is "not significant".	
	Motion by/2nd by	Name (Company)/Name (Company)		
	Vote		XX-XX Motion passed with simple majority	GO TO → (D)
		XX-XX Motion failed with simple majority	GO TO → (C)	
Final	Negative is:			
		(A)	withdrawn (counted under h in disposition)	
		(B)	not related (counted under i in disposition)	
		(C)	related and not persuasive (significant)	
		(D)	not significant (counted under j in disposition)	
		(E)	related and persuasive	DOCUMENT FAILS
		Comment generated. See comment #x		
A&R		Not approved		
		Reason:		

Disposition of Reject 1

	Original number of Negatives	(g)
	# of Negatives withdrawn	(h)
	# of Negatives found not related	(i)
	# of Negatives found not significant	(j)
Final	$g-(h+i+j)=0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is Not Valid and is not included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	$g-(h+i+j)>0$	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject is included in the denominator of § VI. Approval Conditions Check
	Reject without a Negative	<input type="checkbox"/> Not Valid

Note: If all of the negative material included with a reject vote is withdrawn, determined to be not related, or determined to be not significant, the reject vote is not valid. (Regulations ¶ 9.4.3.3)

A&R	Not approved
	Reason:

IV. Comments

Comment 1

Comment	Referenced Section	*TF/Committee to fill in if necessary
	From	John Valley (MEMC)
	Comment	The use of spatial bandwidth, especially fmax, associated with parameters such as SFQR is at this point in time just propagation of a scanned sensor legacy that is now an error in the document. We would be wise to revisit these parameters and describe the requirement in terms of spatial resolution, especially for 300 mm diameter wafers and larger. We should also address real world spatial resolution of 200 mm wafer geometry. I believe M49 may be optimistic for most production equipment in use at 200 mm.
	Discussion	
Action	The committee agreed to do one of the following actions.	
	*No motion is required in this step.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	No further action was taken by the committee.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Refer to the task force for more consideration.
	<input type="checkbox"/>	New Business
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other	

Editorial Change		
		Case 1: No vote in this section :
		To be included and voted on in <u>§ 5. Summary of Editorial Changes</u> .
		Case 2: Voted in this section :
		Original section number and at least one full sentence are required in “FROM” and “TO” fields.
	1	FROM: Section xxx
		To: Section xxx
		Justification (If necessary)
	2	FROM: Section xxx
		To: Section xxx
Justification (If necessary)		
Motion by/2nd	Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Vote	XX-XX Motion passed (or failed)	
A&R		Not approved
		Reason:

V. Summary of Editorial Changes

VI. Approval Conditions Check

APPROVAL CONDITION 1: All negatives have been discussed and were withdrawn, found not related, or not persuasive. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.2)

APPROVAL CONDITION 2: At least 90% of the sum of the valid accept and reject votes must be accept. (Regulations ¶ 9.6.3)

Note: if both approval conditions are not satisfied, the document fails.

	Accepts		(Accepts + Valid Rejects)				
Approval Rate	=		/		=	#DIV/0!	>=90%

A&R		Not approved
		Reason:

VII. Safety Check

See § 14 of the Regulations for further information

Motion:		This is not a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is still technically sound and complete.
		This is a Safety Document: when all safety-related information is removed, the document is not technically sound and complete.
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)
Discussion		XXXX
Vote		XX-XX Motion passed or failed
A&R		Not approved
		Reason:

VIII. Intellectual Property Check

Note: This ballot may be all or part of a Standard or Safety Guideline. This IP check applies to the entire Standard or Safety Guideline. See § 15 of the Regulations for further information

		The meeting chair asked those present in person or by electronic link, if they were aware of any potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items* in the Standard or Guideline.	
		No potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known	GO TO SECTION IX
		Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but a Letter of Assurance (LOA) or copyright release for such material has been obtained or presented to the committee.	GO TO SECTION IX
		Potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items are known but an LOA or copyright release for some of the material(s) has NOT been obtained or presented to the committee	
MOTION	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ask ISC for special permission to publish	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Quit activity	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Wait for LOA for patented technology or release of copyrighted items.	
Motion by/2nd by		Name (Company)/Name (Company)	
Discussion		XXXX	
Vote		XX-XX	
Final Action		<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion Passed
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion Failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason:	

* Note: Such potentially material patented technology or copyrighted items might have become known since the Standard or Safety Guideline was last reviewed, or might become relevant due to this ballot.

IX. Action for this document

Motion	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review as balloted and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document passed committee review with editorial changes and will be forwarded to the A&R for procedural review.	
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and will be returned to the task force for rework.	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	This document failed committee review and work will be discontinued.	
Motion by/2nd by		Friedrich Passek (Siltronic) / Masanori Yoshise	
Discussion		None	
Vote		7-0	
Final Action		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Motion passed
		<input type="checkbox"/>	Motion failed
A&R	<input type="checkbox"/>	Approved	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Not approved	
	<input type="checkbox"/>	Reason:	